

## **APPENDIX 20. TOGO**



March 2022





## A20.1. Executive summary

From January 2021 to March 2022, the project's contribution has resulted in substantial progress in extending not only the social security scheme but also the social health insurance to informal economy actors. The Law on universal health insurance was adopted in October 2021 and, the parameters and mechanisms adapted to extend an old age pension to all workers, including those in the informal economy, were validated in March 2022.

Concerning the extension of the social security scheme, the project supported the design of the extension to workers in the informal economy through generation of evidence and analytical work. First, the NOVISSI programme analysis was completed, and the different actors were informed of the main lessons learned, in particular the innovative experience of using digital technology (through mobile phones) for the delivery of benefits. In addition, the project has actively supported the development of the technical parameters of the old-age pension scheme for all, through some preliminary actuarial simulations. The findings and recommendations of the technical assessment were shared with key stakeholders, following ongoing dialogue sessions with the various organizations of workers in the informal economy. Moreover, representatives of the government at central and local levels, including of the social security fund (Caisse nationale de sécurité sociale - hereafter CNSS) have now strengthened their understanding of the problematic around the extension of social protection. For this, several capacity building activities were conducted: 44 technical managers of the social security fund were trained in 2021 on approaches and mechanisms for extending coverage to workers in the informal economy, in particular on the identification and analysis of needs and expectations of the informal economy workers related to the social security, and translation into policy responses; 117 mayors representing all of Togo's municipalities were sensitized on social security concepts, role of informal economy organizations; technicians and administrators of the public services and CNSS managers were informed and discussed possible policy implications following the results of the COVID-19 impact analysis as well as findings of the informal economy workers incomes' mapping.

Regarding the extension of social health insurance, the project supported the process of adopting the Universal Health Insurance Law. The Law was adopted on 18 October 2021 by the National Assembly of Togo. The adoption of the UHI Law was essential for the achievement of the project's output 3. Indeed, the establishment of a coherent and integrated information system between the CNSS and the INAM for the extension of social protection to the informal sector required that social health insurance be legally extended to workers in the informal economy.

Thus, following the adoption of the Law related to the universal health insurance, the project set up a work plan with the Ministry in charge of health insurance for the elaboration of the technical parameters and the institutional architecture of the extension of social health insurance to workers in the informal economy. This work is being done through a participatory process with the CNSS and other stakeholders in order to achieve an integrated information system.

To conclude, the project, through the generation of evidence and advocacy, contributed to create a context in Togo conducive of future reforms that will accelerate the strengthening and expansion of the social protection system, in particular among workers of the informal economy.

## ► A20.2. Budget/Planning information

Sustainable Development Goals:	SDG 1.3	SDG 1.3		
UNDAF Outcome:	children, women, adolescen elderly, the poor and other increased and equitable acc	From 2019 to 2023, Togolese populations, particularly children, women, adolescents, people with disabilities, the elderly, the poor and other vulnerable groups, have increased and equitable access to social protection and quality basic social services.		
P&B Outcome:	Comprehensive and sustain	Comprehensive and sustainable social protection for all		
DWCP outcome:		TGO126 - Social protection policy for all is formulated and constituents and other relevant stakeholders are empowered.		
Project budget in EUR: <b>196,256</b>				
Project Duration in months: <b>17</b>	Planned	Actual		
Project start date:	October 2020 October 2020			
Project end date:	October 2021	March 2022		

## ► A20.3. Summary outputs

### A20.3.1. Output delivery<sup>1</sup>

Outp	ut	Output status	Output summary		
<b>Outcome 1:</b> Based on the results of the rapid socio-economic impact assessment on the informal sector recommendations are made and national capacities are strengthened to improve and extend the social protection measures initiated as part of the response					
1.1.	A report on the impact of COVID-19 through the social protection dimension is prepared	Completed	An analysis report on the socio-economic impact of COVID-19 including social protection aspects is available. It is based on the analysis of the results of the assessment of COVID-19's impact on the informal economy carried out in November 2020 within the framework of another ILO project funded by the African Development Bank, which also received technical inputs from the SP&PFM project. This analysis indicates that 58.7% of informal economy workers reported a decline in income compared to February 2020. However, a limited proportion of workers in informal economy benefited from response measures against the impact of the crisis. only 10.6% benefited from social protection services: 8.7% from the Universal Solidarity Income Scheme (NOVISSI), 1.3% from health insurance and 0.6% from cash transfers in the form of reduced water and electricity costs.		

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Based on the Implementation Plan.

Outp	Output Output status		Output summary		
			The lack of social protection laws and adapted mechanisms to cover workers outside the formal economy are the main barriers explaining this situation. A lesson learnt from this project is that further mobilization of informal economy actors will be required to strengthen the advocacy for social protection.		
1.2.	Technical services are provided to the government, social partners and informal economy actors for the extension of social protection	Completed	The project conducted an analysis of the State budget for the year 2021. It had noted that few resources were allocated for the implementation of elements of the social protection floor in particular the guarantee of a minimum income. To address this issue, the project organized discussions with the Ministry of Labour and the General Directorate of Social Protection to develop the budget for the year 2022. The 2022 budget review shows an increase in resources allocated to social protection, focusing on the extension of universal health insurance.		
	measures initiated during the COVID-19 period		In 2021, the project was also involved in discussions between the Government, the World Bank, the IMF and the French Agency for Development (AFD) on the implementation of social protection measures to mitigate the effects of the COVID-19 pandemic. As a result of these discussions, the World Bank and AFD are financing a cash transfer programme for a period of 18 months for households in the poorest localities of Togo. The design of this programme took into consideration some of the technical recommendations formulated by the project.		
prote capit	<b>Outcome 2:</b> Experiences, knowledge and evidence generated from the implementation of social protection measures benefiting actors in the informal economy as a response to COVID-19 are capitalized and recommendations are formulated to accelerate the sustainable extension of social protection				

2.1.	1. The Universal Completed Solidarity Income implementation modalities analyzed		Analysis of the NOVISSI programme data showed that a total o 577,251 beneficiaries were reported, with 64.8% women and 35.2% men. This analysis highlights that, in general, the needs the targeted groups were not assessed prior to the implementation of the programme, leading to some inclusion errors. In addition, the interventions were fragmented, and it is not easy to evaluate their real impact.			
			Furthermore, an examination of the operational modalities pointed several shortcomings related to the identification of beneficiaries: the definition of the selection criteria and sources of information have not been done adequately and rigorously. The use of the voter's card has created discrimination, as actors in the informal economy, including migrant workers residing in the country, who do not have this card have been declared ineligible. Moreover, the occupation indicated on the card was considered for the selection of beneficiaries instead of the activity carried out during the crisis. This created confusion and some informal economy workers were also excluded from the NOVISSI program.			

Output Output status			Output summary		
			Despite certain shortcomings and areas for improvement pointed out through this review, the analysis concludes that the use of digital technology for benefit distribution is a good practice that can be used in the process of expanding social security, including among population of the informal economy. This will allow a quick deployment of the social security schemes, including the social health insurance.		
2.2.	Lessons learned from social measures in the respond of COVID-19 capitalized.	Completed	The analysis report included a section on lessons learnt and recommendations for the extension of social protection. The main lessons learned from the NOVISSI programme confirm, firstly, the importance of the project's objective to support the acceleration of the extension of social security to informal economy workers to strengthen their resilience to social risks and shocks.		
			Secondly, the report highlights the importance of having accurate information and data on informal economy workers prior to the implementation of social protection benefits. The design of the NOVISSI programme was not built on such data which has resulted in significant difficulties in identifying and enrolling beneficiaries and in defining an adequate level of benefits.		
			Thirdly, the use of digital technology for the implementation of this programme is an innovative experience that could be replicated for the extension of social security to workers in the informal economy, given the opportunity that payment through mobile phones represents.		
			These main lessons were presented and discussed in the various meetings that the project organised, particularly in the context of the deployment of old age pension for all workers by the CNSS.		

**Outcome 3:** An information system, technical and financial parameters and an institutional coordination architecture for the extension of the general social security system managed by the National Social Security Fund (CNSS) and the compulsory health insurance manage

3.	1.	CNSS an INAM are using an integrated information	Completed	Some delays in the adoption of the UHI Law slowed down the implementation of the integrated registration system that could be used by both the CNSS and the INAM, as the INAM did not previously cover the informal sector.
		system for registering informal economy actors		In preparation of the roll out of the old age pension for all, an IT management system has been developed and integrated into the overall system of the general social security scheme (CNSS), which includes five modules that cover the following areas: registration and contributions management and monitoring, benefit payment management, accounting tracking.
				However, following the adoption of the Law on universal health insurance in October 2021, the project is supporting the definition of technical parameters and the institutional architecture of the universal health insurance, in coherence with the parameters and modalities of the CNSS system.

Outp	but	Output status	Output summary
			Training for this purpose in September and December 2021, then in January 2022. Sessions benefited managers from the Ministry in charge of health insurance. These training sessions focused on the ILO/Health model, the criteria for developing the essential health care package and the data needed for actuarial estimates. This allowed the minister, who participated in all the sessions, to put in place the Health Insurance implementation process.
3.2.	Financial parameters elaborated for the extension of social security to workers in the informal economy	Completed	The proposed strategy and scheme for the extension of coverage by the CNSS was analysed in the light of the ILO Convention No. 102. This exercise allowed the CNSS team to appreciate the advantages and limitations of the different pension scheme options. In addition, the project supported the establishment of a mapping of the contributory capacities of workers in the informal economy. Those data were shared and will be used by the CNSS to determine the financial parameters and the modalities of implementation of the future old-age pension for all.
3.3.	The institutional architecture developed and operational for extending benefits to the informal economy by linking to existing and emerging social protection systems	Completed	The future old-age pension for all will be integrated to the general scheme of CNSS, rather than creating a separate scheme for those workers as initially envisaged by the CNSS technical team, mainly in the informal economy. Such approach embraces the principles embedded in the ILO instruments. Therefore, the implementation of an old-age pension for all is anchored into the existing institutional architecture. The reforms introduced consists in creating adapted services for the registration and benefit management for those workers still uncovered, mainly in the informal economy, through dedicated finance-accounting and IT mechanisms.
3.4.	The legal framework adapted for extending benefits to the informal economy	Delay: behind schedule	The social security legislation review indicates that there is no distinction in terms of legal coverage between self-employed and workers in the informal economy on one hand, and formal employees in the other hand, which have led to some obstacles in extending coverage to all. However, concerning contributions, Order No. 002/2012/MTESS/CAB/DGTLS called for the development of an income categorization to be used as a basis for the determination of the contribution levels of workers in the informal economy. These guidelines have not to date been developed. The project is currently supporting the consultation between the CNSS and the informal economy actors' organisations to develop this document. In addition, the project supports the adoption of a screening strategy to identify the different work situations in the informal economy. The aim is to develop proactive approaches adapted to each work situation to promote access to social protection for workers in this sector.

### A20.3.2. Outputs: Overall delivery assessment<sup>2</sup>

$\boxtimes$	Highly satisfactory	Satisfactory
	Implementation of almost all (>80%) outputs is on schedule as envisaged in the implementation plan and almost all (>80%) indicator milestones have been met. <i>More than 80% of the project' outputs were</i> <i>achieved and all the prerequisite for the</i> <i>implementation of the old age pension for self-</i> <i>workers are in place. In addition, the law on the</i> <i>universal health insurance was adopted.</i>	Implementation of the majority (60-80%) of outputs is on schedule as envisaged in the implementation plan and the majority (60-80%) of indicator milestones have been met.
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
	Unsatisfactory	Very unsatisfactory
	Some (40–60%) outputs are being implemented on schedule as envisaged in the implementation plan and/or only some (40–60%) indicator milestones have been met.	Few (<40%) outputs are being implemented on schedule as envisaged in the implementation plan and/or only a few (<40%) indicator milestones have been met.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> This is a self-assessment.

## ► A20.4. Summary outcomes

### A20.4.1. Outcome achievement<sup>3</sup>

Indicator	<b>Baseline</b> (before project start)	<b>Indicator Milestone</b> (compare planned against actual)	<b>Target</b> (end-of-project goal)	Immediate Outcome summary	
<b>Outcome 1:</b> Based on the results of the rapid s strengthened to improve and extend the social	•			•	
<i>Output 1.1:</i> A report on the impact of COVID-19 through the social protection dimension is prepared	1	1	1	<b>Result achieved:</b> target met As informal economy actors have a very limited knowledge of social security, the project has	
<i>Output 1.2:</i> Technical services are provided to the government, social partners and informal economy actors for the extension of social protection measures initiated during the COVID-19 period	1	1	1	developed a capacity building program that integrates all actors involved in the extension of social security to the informal sector. Thus, 265 officials from the State's technical services and organizations of the informal economy have benefited from the project's support.	
<b>Outcome 2:</b> Experiences, knowledge and evide response to COVID-19 are capitalized and reco <i>Output 2.1:</i> The Universal Solidarity Income				es benefiting actors in the informal economy as a of social coverage <b>On track:</b> most milestones met	
implementation modalities analyzed	CNPPS trained on COVID-19 impact assessment tools in relation to social protection			Support in the use of impact analysis tools in relation to social protection has benefited statisticians from the employment observatory (Ministry of Labor) to enable them to assist the national committee for the promotion of social	



7

Indicator	<b>Baseline</b> (before project start)	<b>Indicator Milestone</b> (compare planned against actual)	<b>Target</b> (end-of-project goal)	Immediate Outcome summary
<i>Output 2.2:</i> Lessons learned from social measures in the respond of COVID-19 capitalized	1	1	1	protection in its technical work, in particular impact analysis and data collection in relation to social protection indicators.
<b>Outcome 3:</b> An information system, technical and system managed by the National Social Security Padopted	•			5 ,
CNSS an INAM are using an integrated information system for registering informal economy actors	1	0	0	<b>On track:</b> most milestones met
Financial parameters elaborated for the extension of social security to workers in the informal economy	1	1	1	<ul> <li>With the support of the project, the CNSS has developed the technical and financial parameters that have made it possible to</li> <li>develop an old age insurance product for all. The Information System has been adapted and specific services have been created to reinforce the registration and social benefits departments.</li> </ul>
The institutional architecture developed and operational for extending benefits to the informal economy by linking to existing and emerging social protection systems	1	1	1	
The legal framework adapted for extending benefits to the informal economy; Workers' organizations, cooperatives, mutual societies and other structures of the informal economy efficiently assume their roles in the extension of social protection	1	0	0	The lateness in adopting the law on universal health insurance did not allow the implementation of an integrated information system shared by INAM and CNSS.

### A20.4.2. Achievement of the project outcomes

Highly probable Almost all (>80%) reporting period milestones have been met. Based on the indicators and risk assessment, it is highly probable all outcomes will be achieved by the end of the project.	<b>Probable</b> The majority (60–80%) of reporting period milestones have been met. Based on the indicators and risk assessment, it is probable the majority of outcomes will be achieved.
Low probability Some (40–60%) reporting period milestones have been met. Progress is being made on the outcomes but based on the indicators and risk assessment only some outcomes will be achieved.	Improbable Few (<40%) reporting period milestones have been met. Limited progress is being made on the outcomes and based on the indicators and risk assessment only a few outcomes will be achieved.

## A20.5. Narrative report: Managing for results

#### A20.5.1. Results summary

The implementation of the project focuses on three key results, including improving knowledge based on the experience of the NOVISSI programme, developing technical and financial parameters for the extension of social security to workers in the informal economy, and building the capacity of the key actors. The project contributed to the extension of social security guarantees to workers in the informal economy through the achievement of these results.

Thanks to the data and information generated by the project, the project's technical support to promote a rights-based approach, the capacity building for an effective social dialogue, the old-age pension for all is being implemented into the social security scheme. The CNSS is currently conducting consultations with socio-professional organizations of the informal economy n order to launch this old age pension by March 2022.

The project' results are contributing to the extension of social security to categories of the population not yet covered. The project's results directly strengthened the technical expertise in the CNSS to develop appropriate social insurance guarantees in line with the requirements of the ILO Convention No. 102. The analytical work and technical reports provide evidence and guidance on the different sources of financing of social protection that are aligned with the principles of solidarity through collective financing and risks pooling, thus securing that no one is left behind.

This will ensure that the country progresses in achieving universal social protection coverage through adequate and sustainable systems, with the aim of increasing the resilience of the Togolese population to social risks and shocks such as the COVID-19 socio-economic crisis.

The extension of social protection is one of the pillars of the Togo Decent Work Programme and an expected result of the UNDAF. It is also a priority of the National Development Plan (NDP). Togo has also subscribed to SDG targets 1.3, 3.8 and 8b. The project created the required technical conditions for an effective extension of the social security system for all workers, including those in the informal economy. It also facilitated the adoption of the Law on universal health insurance. These project results are directly contributing to the achievement of the DWCP, UNDAF and PND outcome.

## A20.5.2. Monitoring, evaluations, and other reviews including with implementing partners and EU Delegations

The project's monitoring and evaluation was performed according to the indicator's framework developed during the project design. Information and data related to each indicator has been recorded. This helped to evaluate the progress made in achieving each outcome.

Meetings were organized with the tripartite technical committee set up at the beginning of the project to regularly review progress of the project, main results, potential challenges and way forward. It should be remembered that this committee is composed of representatives of the ministries in charge of labour, agriculture, commerce, transport, the informal sector, leaders of the informal sector workers' professional organisations and the of transport companies' union affiliated to the employers' organisations, as well as representatives of CNSS. The European Union Delegation was informed about the project implementation process and a summary note on the results of the project prepared and sent to the European Union delegation.

The project monitoring and evaluation highlighted the strategic position of local authorities and guilds chambers in the awareness raising and training activities with a view to promote the social protection culture in the local communities and among the artisanal workers. Thus, these two actors have been integrated among the key stakeholders and their representatives have been trained on social security.

#### A20.5.3. Main challenges, risks and corrective action

The occurrences of the health crisis related to COVID-19 did not allow all activities, in particular presential meetings, to be carried out within the timeframe. In addition, the economic crisis created an issue in which it was more difficult to advocate for investments in social protection. The budgetary efforts made are more oriented to the economic activities' revitalization.

#### A20.5.4. Opportunities and corresponding strategy adjustments

The decentralized awareness raising activities, which involved 117 new municipalities, was a useful opportunity for the project's visibility. The project has reinforced the capacities of the authorities of these communes, which will be essential for the implementation of the universal health insurance and old-age pension for all. As a result, the awareness-raising activities on social protection have been integrated into the municipalities' actions. The adoption of the law on health insurance also provides an opportunity to accelerate the process of extending social protection to the informal economy. Indeed, the introduction of a package including health insurance and old age pension for all will increase the motivation of the informal economy workers for social security.

# A20.5.5. Contribution of the Project to the COVID-19 response and recovery

The project has provided information and data, as well as technical inputs, for the development of the response to the socio-economic effects of COVID-19 pandemic both within the UN system and at the level of national stakeholders, using the results of the studies carried out with the ILO

support to evaluate the impact of COVID-19 on the informal economy. During the World Bank and AFD missions and during the negotiations between the IMF and Togo, the project highlighted the crucial value of extending social protection to the informal sector through contributory systems as a more sustainable approach in building resilience to a poverty.

#### A20.5.6. Specific interventions related to public finance management

The review of the 2021 public budget had revealed that there were insufficient resources allocated to support the implementation of the social protection floor components such as the minimum income guarantee. The project advised the Social Protection Directorate of the Ministry of Labour to conduct a public finance analysis in order to develop an internal resource mobilisation strategy for social protection. The same advocacy was done with institutions providing budgetary support to Togo such as the World Bank and the IMF.

The Ministry of Labour owned this approach and undertook initiatives vis-a-vis the Ministry of Economy and Finances for increased financing of social protection. As a result of the advocacy supported by the project, the Ministry of Labour also emphasised the importance of investing in social protection during the negotiation concerning the IMF intervention in Togo. Togo is also part of the partnership between the ILO and the IMF. This partnership will support the countrywide in the identification of fiscal spaces and innovative financing for the extension of social protection.

The project, in coordination with support of the ILO's social protection specialist based in Dakar, participated in IMF negotiations with the Togolese Government in June 2021 and March 2022. Surveys and analysis reports related to decent work and particularly social protection were shared with the IMF delegation. During these negotiations, advice have been given to the Ministry of Labour and the Ministry in charge of universal health coverage to help them negotiate for a significant budgetary support for social protection. Inputs were provided for an adapted definition of social spending as part of the Extend Credit Facility to be concluded by IMF and the Government. In addition, the project has obtained the acceptance of the French Development Agency (AFD) and the World Bank to work together to develop actions that reinforce the extension of social protection to the informal sector through contributory systems.

## A20.5.7. Complementarity with the EU Delegation's interventions and on-going and future Budget Support Programmes

Through the joint programming of the European Union and the Member States, notably Germany and France plan for the period 2021–2024 to support the countrywide, among other things, in the implementation of its strategies aimed at poverty reduction and inclusive economic and social development, promoting, including universal access to quality essential services as well as in democratic consolidation based on respect for human rights (including fundamental labour rights) and the rule of law, the decentralization process, and the modernization of Togo's political, economic, and social governance systems.

They also plan to support the promotion of trade, investment, and job creation, by seizing the opportunities offered by regional and continental integration, the development of the digital economy and a circular economy as well as the country's agro-industrial potential.

This joint programming is an outstanding opportunity as it will contribute to ensuring the effectiveness and sustainability of the process of extending social security to all. Indeed, it will promote access to basic social services and employment while facilitating the population's access

to digital technology, a necessary condition to accelerate the enrolment of the informal economy's workers to the social security schemes.

## A20.5.8. Synergies with other social protection interventions and strategic partnerships with other development partners

The Ministry of Universal Health Coverage is implementing a World Bank funded project to improve access to health services for vulnerable populations. UNDP is supporting a pilot project for the development of tools for health insurance for indigent people. The project participates to the technical discussions and provides information and evidence concerning the informal economy actors' needs and expectations in terms of social protection. The project also advises on social security so that the actions undertaken within these projects do not undermine social security standards.

#### A20.5.9. Overall budget analysis

The project budget is 196,256 euros. About 95% of this budget was delivered. This amount effectively corresponds to the level of planned expenditures. In the implementation, the project has mobilized, in accordance with the agreement between the ILO and the Government, the national contribution that covers the rent, electricity and water costs. In addition, the project has benefited of equipment from projects previously implemented by the ILO. This permitted to save resources that are been reallocated for the capacity building activities.

 Self-evaluation results (mandatory section for projects up to USD 500,000 in lieu of a separate evaluation report)

**Efficiency** – How optimally were the resources and inputs (e.g. funds, expertise, time, etc.) used to produce results? Do the expected project results justify the costs incurred? To what extent did the project leverage resources (financial, partnerships, expertise) to promote gender equality and non-discrimination?

The project's financial resources and ILO experts were fully mobilized for the implementation of the project. The resources allocated were mainly devoted to reinforcing the capacities of the actors and technical analyses. Several ILO experts in addition to the project coordinator were mobilized: the social protection specialist of the decent work team based in Dakar, the heads of the units in charge of actuarial studies, social security standards, the GLO/19/50/EUR project advisor, etc.

Within the capacity building and consultation activities, the project has particularly taken into account the representation of both women and men in order to ensure that the different points of view on social security are taken into account.

### A20.5.10. Lessons learned and good practices

The strategy based on social dialogue involving all stakeholders (government, social security fund, informal sector unions) for the extension of social security to informal economy actors is a good practice The social dialogue process involving all stakeholders (government, social security fund, informal economy unions) for the extension of social security to informal economy actors is a good practice within the framework of this project given the challenges related to the extension of social protection to the informal sector (under-information of informal economy actors on the

principles of social security, deficits in knowledge of the realities of the informal economy by CNSS teams, mistrust of informal economy workers, etc.).

The digitalization of services and the ongoing adaptation of CNSS procedures also are innovative good practices that can be shared.

### A20.5.11. Visibility & Communication

In order to ensure the visibility of the project and in particular the action of the donor, an official launching ceremony of the project was organized in accordance with the EU delegation in Togo.

This ceremony was covered by the public and private media: press, radio, and television as well as the online press. An information note on the project was prepared and distributed to the media and partners. This note was prepared by the project and revised by the EU delegation in Togo. The project is in the process of preparing a summary note on the results of the project to be sent to the EU in Togo as well as to the different partners.

# **A20.5.12. Conclusions and Recommendations** (Mandatory section for projects up to USD 500,000 in lieu of a separate evaluation report)

Conclusions and recomr	Conclusions and recommendations from the self-evaluation				
Conclusions <sup>4</sup>	<ol> <li>Improving the knowledge of key actors, such as workers in the informal economy, about the fundamentals of social security has lastingly cleared the way for the successful extension of social security to the informal sector. This is of crucial value in the context of Togo, where the tendency is to implement scattered and unsustainable social assistance programs. Informal economy workers' ownership of key issues such as social security, solidarity, financing through social contributions, risk sharing, universality, equity and sustainability of social benefits, etc. was necessary to ensure their commitment to social security.</li> </ol>				
	2. It is critical to ensure that the social benefit guarantees provided to workers in the informal economy are in line with international standards (ILO C102), despite the challenges and difficulties involved in extending social security. This makes it possible to avoid social security guarantees that do not comply with international standards and are below minimum standards, which can finally lead to the exclusion of workers from the social security economy.				

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Conclusions should synthesize the main findings into statements of merit and worth. As such, judgments need to be fair, impartial, and consistent with the findings.

Conclusions and recommendations from the self-evaluation			
Recommendations <sup>5</sup>	<ol> <li>Maintain consultation and dialogue with the actors of the informal economy to facilitate the monitoring of the operationalization of the old age insurance in order to proceed with the required readjustment</li> </ol>	Responsible entity: CNSS	
		Priority (high, medium, low): Medium	
		Resources (high, medium, low, NA): Low	
		<b>Timeframe</b> (long-, medium, short-term): Medium-term	
	2. Support the reflection on the financing of the minimum income for the elders who do not have the contributory capacity to benefit from the old age pension system	Responsible entity: BIT	
		Priority (high, medium, low): High	
		Resources (high, medium, low, NA): High	
		<b>Timeframe</b> ( <i>long-, medium, short-term</i> ): Short-term	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Recommendations should follow from conclusions; link to lessons learned; and describe a time-frame (short-, medium-, long-term), the degree of priority (high, medium, low), who is called upon to act and acknowledge whether there are any resource implications.

### > Annex A20.A1. Project risk register<sup>6</sup>

Risk Identified	Mitigating Measures	Additional risk response <sup>7</sup>	Change <sup>8</sup>	Impact <sup>9</sup>
The Social Security Code regulations are not sufficiently precise to allow the extension of social security benefits to workers in the informal economy.	Concerning contributions, Order No. 002/2012/MTESS/CAB/DGTLS required the development of an income scale to be used as a basis for the determination of the workers in the informal economy contribution levels. This document has not to date been developed. The project has developed data on informal economy workers' incomes and a contributory capacity matrix. The project is currently supporting the consultation between CNSS and the informal economy actors' organisations to develop this document.		Decrease in the total level of risk	The process of extending social security to workers in the informal economy continues without substantial legal obstacles
The representative organizations of the informal economy do not have the capacity to assume delegated managerial responsibilities in the extension of social security to the informal economy.	The leaders of the informal economy organizations have been trained on the procedures, modalities and benefits of the general social security scheme. A consultation process has been set up for the conclusion of delegation agreements concerning the actions they will carry out (awareness raising, support for registration, etc.)		Decrease in the total level of risk	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Use the existing project risk register for filling in this table.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Outline any additional mitigating measures or any change in the planned mitigating strategy and provide a rationale.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> The change column summarizes any change in the identified risk as a result of the corrective/mitigating measures.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Outline the impact on project objectives once the mitigating measures were put in place.

Risk Identified	Mitigating Measures	Additional risk response <sup>7</sup>	Change <sup>8</sup>	Impact <sup>9</sup>
The modalities and levels of benefits developed in the context of extending social protection to workers in the informal economy are not in line with relevant standards.	The CNSS proposal concerning the old age insurance for all was analyzed in the light of the ILO Convention No. 102. This allowed the CNSS team to appreciate the advantages and limitations of the different pension scheme options.	The dialogue with the authorities does not result in the mobilization of the necessary funding to ensure the social security coverage of the most vulnerable people.	Decrease in the total level of risk	The CNSS proposal has been revised to align with the minimum standards
Political decision-making is sluggish, and in the event of a change at the INAM, CNSS or government level, the various discussions have to be re-opened from zero.			No change in the total level of risk	
NOVISSI programme database is not fully accurate for the evaluation of the programme.	Data on the NOVISSI program are only partially available. The project used analysis reports produced by the General Direction of Social Protection, as well as those posted on the program's website.		Decrease in the total level of risk	This has delayed the elaboration of lessons learned from this program
The level of the COVID-19 pandemic leads to restrictive measures by avoiding the meetings.	The project has adapted the organization of activities to the Government's measures to address COVID-19, especially in the organization of multi-stakeholder activities.		No change in the total level of risk	Considerable delay in the implementation of the project

## > Annex A20.A2. Knowledge products of the project

List of knowledge products, technical reports and studies produced by the project. All documents listed here will be attached to the progress report and should be uploaded to the website <u>www.socialprotection-pfm.org</u> and the ILO social protection country page.

Title of the product or report	<b>Type of product</b> (working paper, brief, technical report, video, capacity building content, etc.)	Published/not published
Presse release	Informational document	Published
Project presentation note	Working paper	Published
Cartography of the contributory capacities of the informal economy workers liable to the general social security system	Technical report	Not published
PowerPoint presentation on the contributory capacities of the informal economy workers liable to the general social security system	Capacity building	Not published
Video concerning the training of mayors on old age insurance	Video	Not published
Technical note on the pension scheme proposed by the CNSS for non-salaried workers in Togo	Working paper	Not published

### Annex A20.A3. Communication and visibility

Include relevant documentation, photo, web link, multimedia or information that may contribute to a better understanding of project progress, and demonstrate good communication and visibility of the project.

- **1.** Cartography of the contributory capacities of the informal economy workers liable to the general social security system
- 2. <u>https://oneftogo.org/2022/03/17/rapport-de-levaluation-rapide-des-impacts-de-la-covid-19-sur-leconomie-informelle/</u>
- **3.** PowerPoint presentation on the contributory capacities of the informal economy workers liable to the general social security system
- 4. Video concerning the training of mayors on old age insurance
- **5.** Technical note on the pension scheme proposed by the CNSS for non-salaried workers in Togo
- 6. <u>https://www.savoirnews.net/extension-de-la-securite-sociale-aux-acteurs-du-secteur-informel-le-projet-officiellement-lance-ce-jeudi-a-lome/</u>
- 7. <u>https://www.republiquetogolaise.com/social/2602-5203-la-securite-sociale-va-s-etendre-au-secteur-informel</u>
- 8. <u>https://linterview.info/2021/02/25/togo-334-millions-acteurs-de-leconomie-informelle-beneficieront-dune-securite-sociale/</u>
- 9. <u>https://www.horizon-news.net/index.php/fr/component/k2/item/5245-economie-informelle-l-extension-de-la-securite-sociale-aux-acteurs-touchera-3-34-millions-de-travailleurs-dont-52-7-de-femme</u>
- **10.** <u>https://togobreakingnews.info/societe/item/6983-cnss-processus-d-immatriculation-de-pres-de-3-5-millions-de-travailleurs</u>
- **11.** <u>Togo: Extension de la sécurité sociale aux acteurs de l'économie informelle</u> <u>(lavoixdelanation.info)</u>
- **12.** Cartography of the contributory capacities of the informal economy workers submitted to the general social security system
- **13.** Video concerning the training of mayors on old age insurance
- **14.** Technical note on the pension scheme proposed by the CNSS for non-salaried workers in Togo

## Annex A20.A4. Emerging good practice

Country	Тодо
Title of the practice	Accelerating social security extension to the informal sector through social dialogue
<b>Summary</b> – Briefly describe the good practice, including results and the support provided by the SP&PFM Programme (1 paragraph)	The SP&PFM project advised and provided technical support for the implementation of a strategy based on social dialogue involving all stakeholders (government, social security fund, informal sector unions) for the extension of social security to informal economy actors. This process of dialogue has enabled the social security fund to develop an old age insurance guarantee for all. accepted by all concerned stakeholders.
<b>Context</b> – Describe relevant elements of the context and the preconditions of practice (the starting point)	Since 2011, the law in Togo has extended social security to workers in the informal sector. But more than a decade ago, these workers could not be registered in the social security system. The CNSS, the social security administration body, was lacking a strategy and did not have the knowledge of the realities, needs and expectations of workers in the informal economy concerning social protection. Workers in the informal economy were not aware what the social security system was, what its benefits were, what its procedures were, and how it functioned.
<b>Good practice</b> – Present the practice/experience, explaining the actors involved, the innovative methods/working methodology, the step-by-step to achieve the results	<ul> <li>The experiment consisted in overcoming the gap between the social security system and the informal sector.</li> <li>The strategy focused on: <ol> <li>improving the CNSS's knowledge on the informal economy (mapping of workers' organizations, development of data on the income of informal sector workers);</li> <li>training the leaders of the informal economy workers' organizations on social protection and its importance, on the procedures and modalities as well as on the social security guarantees offered by the social security system;</li> <li>setting up a consultation committee involving the key stakeholders concerned with informal economy workers' social protection, namely representatives of the government (Ministry of Labor), the National Social Security Fund (CNSS), and workers' representatives;</li> <li>supporting the adoption of a communication plan and the setting up of a joint team in charge to conduct awareness and training activities at the national level.</li> </ol> </li> </ul>

Country	Тодо
<b>Main results</b> – Briefly describe the results already achieved	<ol> <li>The informal economy workers' organizations have appropriated the advocacy process for the extension of social security to their members. They have a consensus concerning a short-term social guarantee, health insurance, and a long-term guarantee, old age insurance. They address recurrent demands to both the social security funds and the national authorities.</li> <li>The Social Security Fund (CNSS) has a command of the realities of the informal economy workers and has adapted its language.</li> <li>The Social Security Fund (CNSS) instituted dedicated services for these workers and has developed an old age insurance for all.</li> </ol>
<b>Success factors</b> – List the factors that contributed to the success of the practice (bullet points)	<ol> <li>The factors that contributed to this innovative experience are:         <ol> <li>existence of a favorable legal framework for the extension of social security to workers in the informal economy;</li> <li>existence of workers' organizations in the informal sector, in particular their federation of trade unions;</li> <li>technical support in conducting consultation and dialogue processes involving labor actors;</li> <li>availability of relevant data on the working conditions and on the organization of workers in the informal economy (mapping of organizations in the informal economy workers' income, etc.);</li> <li>commitment of the private formal and public sector trade union movement for the extension of social protection in the informal economy sector.</li> </ol> </li> </ol>
<b>Challenges</b> – List the main existing challenges (bullet points)	<ol> <li>The instability of informal economy workers' incomes.</li> <li>The concurrence of private insurance and microfinance institutions.</li> </ol>
<b>Lessons learned</b> – Indicate up to 3 lessons learned from this experience that could be useful for other countries (more general than success factors)	<ol> <li>A good knowledge of the context of the informal economy.</li> <li>A solid command of the national social security legislation and the international standards, particularly the ILO standards on social security, is necessary to guide the social dialogue process.</li> <li>The ownership of the approach by the trade union federations is essential to the success of the dialogue process.</li> </ol>
Next steps	Establish a roadmap to monitor and evaluate the effective implementation of the old-age insurance for all while continuing working on the implementation of the other guarantees.